ME233 Advanced Control II Lecture 1

Dynamic Programming & Optimal Linear Quadratic Regulators (LQR)

(ME233 Class Notes DP1-DP4)

Outline

1. Dynamic Programming

2. Simple multi-stage example

3. Solution of finite-horizon optimal Linear Quadratic Reguator (LQR)

Invented by Richard Bellman in 1953

- From IEEE History Center: Richard Bellman:
 - "His invention of dynamic programming in 1953 was a major breakthrough in the theory of multistage decision processes..."
 - "A breakthrough which set the stage for the application of functional equation techniques in a wide spectrum of fields..."
 - "...extending far beyond the problem-areas which provided the initial motivation for his ideas."

Invented by Richard Bellman in 1953

- From IEEE History Center: Richard Bellman:
 - In 1946 he entered Princeton as a graduate student at age 26.
 - He completed his Ph.D. degree in a record time of three months.
 - His Ph.D. thesis entitled "Stability Theory of Differential Equations" (1946) was subsequently published as a book in 1953, and is regarded as a classic in its field.

We will use dynamic programming to derive the solution of:

- Discrete time LQR and related problems
- Discrete time Linear Quadratic Gaussian (LQG) controller.
 - Optimal estimation and regulation





 Number next to line is the "cost" in going along that particular path.







- Optimal path from A to B is the one with the smallest overall cost.
- There are 70 possible routes starting from **A**.

Key idea:

- Convert a single "large" optimization problem into a series of "small" multistage optimization problems.
 - Principle of optimality: "From any point on an optimal trajectory, the remaining trajectory is optimal for the corresponding problem initiated at that point."
 - Optimal Value Function: Compute the optimal value of the cost from each state to the final state.

Illustrative Example:

- Use principle of optimality
- Compute Optimal Value Function and optimal control at each state
- Start from the final state B

determine the optimal path from () to B



Illustrative Example:

- Use principle of optimality
- Compute Optimal Value Function and optimal control at each state
- Start from the final state **B**

two options:

7 + 9 = 16

11 + 12 = 23



Illustrative Example:

- Use principle of optimality
- Compute Optimal Value Function and optimal control at each state
- Start from the final state B

Assign:

- optimal path
- optimal cost



Illustrative Example:

- Use principle of optimality
- Compute Optimal Value Function and optimal control at each state
- Start from the final state B

Continue...

10 + 15 = 2512 + 16 = 28



Illustrative Example:

- Use principle of optimality
- Compute Optimal Value Function and optimal control at each state
- Start from the final state B





LTI Optimal regulators

State space description of a discrete time LTI

$$\begin{aligned} x(k+1) &= A x(k) + B u(k) \\ x(0) &= x_o \end{aligned}$$

For now, everything is deterministic

- Find "optimal" control $u^{0}(k), k = 0, 1, 2 \cdots$ In some sense, to be defined later...
- That drives the state to the origin

$$x \rightarrow 0$$

Finite Horizon LQ optimal regulator

Consider the nth order discrete time LTI system:

$$x(k+1) = Ax(k) + Bu(k)$$
 $x(0) = x_0$

We want to find the optimal control sequence:

$$U_0^o = \{u^o(0), u^o(1), \cdots, u^o(N-1)\}$$

which minimizes the cost functional:

$$x^{T}(N)Q_{f}x(N) + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

Finite Horizon LQ optimal regulator

Consider the nth order discrete time LTI system:

$$x(k+1) = Ax(k) + Bu(k)$$
 $x(0) = x_0$

Notice that the value of the cost depends on the initial condition $x(0) = x_0$

$$J[x(0)] = x^{T}(N)Q_{f}x(N) + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

To emphasize the dependence on $x(0) = x_{O}$

LQ Cost Functional:

$$J[x(0)] = x^{T}(N)Q_{f}x(N) + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

- N total number of steps—"horizon"
- $x^T(N)Q_f x(N)$

• $\begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^T & B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$

penalizes the final state deviation from the origin

penalizes the transient state deviation from the origin and the control effort



LQ Cost Functional:

Simplified nomenclature:

$$J[x(0)] = x^{T}(N)Q_{f}x(N) + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

final state
cost
$$J[x(0)] = L_{f}[x(N)] + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)]$$

Additional notation

For
$$m = 0, 1, ..., N - 1$$
 define:

Optimal control sequence from instance m

$$U_m^o = (u^o(m), u^o(m+1), \dots, u^o(N-1))$$

Arbitrary control sequence from instance m:

$$U_m = \left(u(m), u(m+1), \ldots, u(N-1)\right)$$

Optimal cost functional

$$J^{o}[x(0)] = \min_{U_{0}} \left\{ L_{f}[x(N)] + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$$

Function of initial state $J[x(0)]$

$$U_0 = (u(0), u(1), \ldots, u(N-1))$$

Control sequence from instance 0

Optimal Incremental Cost Function

For
$$m = 0, 1, ..., N - 1$$
 define:

Optimal cost function from state x(m) at instant m

$$J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{U_m} \left\{ L_f[x(N)] + \sum_{k=m}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$$

$$U_m = (u(m), u(m+1), \ldots, u(N-1))$$

Control sequence from instance m

Optimal Cost Function

Optimal cost function at the final state x(N)

$$J_N^o[x(N)] = L_f[x(N)]$$

... only a function of the final state x(N)

For m = 0, 1, ..., N - 2: Optimal value function: $J_m^o[x(m)]$



Optimal value function: (m = 0, 1, ..., N - 2) $J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{U_m} \left\{ L_f[x(N)] + L[x(m), u(m)] + \sum_{k=m+1}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$

$$= \min_{u(m)} \min_{U_{m+1}} \left\{ L_f[x(N)] + L[x(m), u(m)] + \sum_{k=m+1}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$$

$$= \min_{u(m)} \left\{ L[x(m), u(m)] + \min_{U_{m+1}} \left\{ L_f[x(N)] + \sum_{k=m+1}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\} \right\}$$

$$J_{m+1}^o[x(m+1)] = J_{m+1}^o[Ax(m) + Bu(m)]$$

Optimal value function: $(m = 0, 1, \dots, N - 2)$

$$J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{U_m} \left\{ L_f[x(N)] + \sum_{k=m}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$$



given x(m), these are only functions of u(m) !!

only an optimization with respect to a single vector

Bellman Equation

$$J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{u(m)} \left\{ L[x(m), u(m)] + J_{m+1}^o[x(m+1)] \right\}$$
$$m = 0, 1, \dots, N-1$$

1. The Bellman equation can be solved recursively (backwards), starting from N:

$$J_N^o[x(N)] = L_f[x(N)]$$

2. Each iteration involves only an optimization with respect to a single variable (u(m)) - multistage optimization

$$J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{u(m)} \left\{ L[x(m), u(m)] + J_{m+1}^o[x(m+1)] \right\}$$
$$m = 0, 1, \dots, N-1$$

$$J_{N}^{o}[x(N)] = L_{f}[x(N)] \quad boundary \ condition$$

$$known \ function \ of \ x(N)$$

not known

Recursive Solution to the Bellman Equation

Start with N-1: assume that x(N-1) is given

find $u^0(N-1)$ by solving:

known function of x(N)

$$J_{N-1}^{o}[x(N-1)] = \min_{u(N-1)} \left\{ L[x(N-1), u(N-1)] + L_f[(x(N))] \right\}$$
$$x(N) = Ax(N-1) + Bu(N-1)$$

 $u^{0}(N-1)$ will be a function of x(N-1)

Recursive Solution to the Bellman Equation

Continue with *N-2:* assume that x(N-2) is given

find $u^0(N-2)$ by solving: known function of x(N-1) $J_{N-2}^{o}[x(N-2)] = \min_{u(N-2)} \left\{ L[x(N-2), u(N-2)] + J_{N-1}^{o}[x(N-1)] \right\}$ x(N-1) = Ax(N-2) + Bu(N-2)

 $u^{0}(N-2)$ will be a function of x(N-2)

Solving the Bellman Equation for a LQR

$$J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{u(m)} \left\{ L[x(m), u(m)] + J_{m+1}^o[x(m+1)] \right\}$$
$$m = 0, 1, \dots, N - 1$$

1)
$$J_N^o[x(N)] = L_f[x(N)] = x^T(N) Q_f x(N)$$

2)
$$L[x(k), u(k)] = \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^T & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$$

Quadratic functions

Minimization of quadratic functions

For
$$M_{22} \succ 0$$
 we have that:
• $\min_{u} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} M_{11} & M_{12} \\ M_{12}^{T} & M_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix} = x^{T} (M_{11} - M_{12}M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T})x$

• Optimal *u* given by $u^{o} = -M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T}x$ **Proof:**

$$\begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} M_{11} & M_{12} \\ M_{12}^{T} & M_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix} = x^{T} M_{11} x + x^{T} M_{12} u + u^{T} M_{12}^{T} x + u^{T} M_{22} u$$
Completing the square
$$(u + M_{22}^{-1} M_{12}^{T} x)^{T} M_{22} (u + M_{22}^{-1} M_{12}^{T} x) - x^{T} M_{12} M_{22}^{-1} M_{12}^{T} x$$

Minimization of quadratic functions

For
$$M_{22} \succ 0$$
 we have that:
• $\min_{u} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} M_{11} & M_{12} \\ M_{12}^{T} & M_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix} = x^{T} (M_{11} - M_{12}M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T})x$

• Optimal u given by $u^o = -M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^T x$ **Proof:**

$$\begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} M_{11} & M_{12} \\ M_{12}^{T} & M_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u \end{bmatrix} = x^{T} (M_{11} - M_{12}M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T})x + (u + M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T}x)^{T}M_{22}(u + M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^{T}x)$$

$$\geq x^T (M_{11} - M_{12} M_{22}^{-1} M_{12}^T) x, \quad \forall u$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} x \\ u^o \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} M_{11} & M_{12} \\ M_{12}^T & M_{22} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x \\ u^o \end{bmatrix} = x^T (M_{11} - M_{12}M_{22}^{-1}M_{12}^T)x$$

$$J_k^o[x(k)] = x(k)^T P(k) x(k)$$
$$u^o(k) = -K(\underline{k+1}) x(k)$$
$$K(k) = [B^T P(k) B + R]^{-1} [B^T P(k) A + S^T]$$

Where P(k) is computed **backwards in time** using the *discrete Riccati difference equation* :

$$P(N) = Q_f$$

$$P(k-1) = A^T P(k)A + Q$$

$$- [A^T P(k)B + S][B^T P(k)B + R]^{-1}[B^T P(k)A + S^T]$$

Proof (by induction on decreasing *k*)

Let
$$J_{k+1}^o[x(k+1)] = x(k+1)^T P(k+1)x(k+1)$$

(Trivially holds for $k=N-1$ by definition of $J_N^o[x(N)]$)

$$J_{k+1}^{o}[x(k+1)] = [Ax(k) + Bu(k)]^{T}P(k+1)[Ax(k) + Bu(k)]$$
$$x(k+1) = \begin{bmatrix} A & B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$$

$$J_{k+1}^{o}[x(k+1)] = [Ax(k) + Bu(k)]^{T}P(k+1)[Ax(k) + Bu(k)]$$
$$\begin{bmatrix} A & B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} A^T \\ B^T \end{bmatrix} P(k+1) \begin{bmatrix} A & B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} A^T P(k+1)A & A^T P(k+1)B \\ B^T P(k+1)A & B^T P(k+1)B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}$$

The Bellman equation gives

 $J_{k}^{o}[x(k)] = \min_{u(k)} \left\{ L[x(k), u(k)] + J_{k+1}^{o}[x(k+1)] \right\}$ $= \min_{u(k)} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} A^{T}P(k+1)A & A^{T}P(k+1)B \\ B^{T}P(k+1)A & B^{T}P(k+1)B \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$

 $= \min_{u(k)} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} A^T P(k+1)A + Q & A^T P(k+1)B + S \\ B^T P(k+1)A + S^T & B^T P(k+1)B + R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$

$$J_k^o[x(k)] = \min_{u(k)} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} A^T P(k+1)A + Q & A^T P(k+1)B + S \\ B^T P(k+1)A + S^T & B^T P(k+1)B + R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

Using results for quadratic optimizations:

$$J_k^o[x(k)] = x(k)^T P(k) x(k)$$
$$u^o(k) = -K(k+1) x(k)$$

where

$$P(k) = A^T P(k+1)A + Q - [A^T P(k+1)B + S]$$

× $[B^T P(k+1)B + R]^{-1}[B^T P(k+1)A + S^T]$
 $K(k+1) = [B^T P(k+1)B + R]^{-1}[B^T P(k+1)A + S^T]$

Example – Double Integrator

Double integrator with ZOH and sampling time T = 1:



Example – Double Integrator

$$\begin{bmatrix} x_1(k+1) \\ x_2(k+1) \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x_1(k) \\ x_2(k) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0.5 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} u(k)$$
LQR cost:

$$J[x_0] = x^T(N)Q_f x(N) + \sum_{k=0}^{N-1} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix}^T \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^T & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} x(k) \\ u(k) \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$

Choose: $Q = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1} & \mathbf{0} \\ \mathbf{0} & \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix}$ $x_1^2(k) + Ru^2(k)$ R > 0S = 0 $P(N) = Q_f \succeq 0$

only penalize position x_1 and control *u* Example – Double Integrator (DI) Compute P(k) for an arbitrary $P(N) = Q_f$ and N.

Computing backwards:

$$P(k-1) = A^{T}P(k)A + Q$$

$$-A^{T}P(k)B \left[B^{T}P(k)B + R\right]^{-1}B^{T}P(k)A$$

$$R > 0$$

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \quad B = \begin{bmatrix} 0.5 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \qquad Q = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

 $P(N) = Q_f$

Example – DI Finite Horizon Case 1 • N = 10, R = 10, $P(10) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$



Example – DI Finite Horizon Case 2 • N = 30, R = 10, $P(30) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$



Example – DI Finite Horizon Case 3 • N = 30, R = 10, $P(30) = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$



Example – DI Finite Horizon

Observation:

In all cases, regardless of the choice of $P(N) = Q_f$

when the horizon, *N*, is sufficiently large

the backwards computation of the Riccati Eq. always converges to the same solution:

$$P(0) = \begin{bmatrix} 3 & 3.16 \\ 3.16 & 8.1 \end{bmatrix}$$

We will return to this important idea in a few lectures

Properties of Matrix P(k)

P(k) satisfies:

1)
$$P(k) = P^T(k)$$
 (symmetric)

2) $P(k) \succeq 0$ (positive semi-definite)

Properties of Matrix P(k)

$$P(k) = P^{T}(k)$$
 (symmetric)

Proof: (by induction on decreasing *k*)

$$\begin{array}{l} \underline{Base \ case, \ k=N:} \\ P(N)^T = Q_f^T = Q_f = P(N) \\ \\ \underline{For} \ k \in \{0, 1, \dots, N-1\} : \\ P(k) = A^T P(k+1)A + Q - [A^T P(k+1)B + S] \\ \times [B^T P(k+1)B + R]^{-1} [B^T P(k+1)A + S^T] \end{array}$$

Transpose both sides of the equation

Properties of Matrix P(k) $P(k) \succeq 0$ (positive semi-definite)

Proof: (by induction on decreasing *k*)

<u>Base case, k=N:</u> $P(N) = Q_f \succeq 0$ For $k \in \{0, 1, \dots, N-1\}$: $P(k) = A^T P(k+1)A + Q - [A^T P(k+1)B + S]$ $\times [B^T P(k+1)B + R]^{-1} [B^T P(k+1)A + S^T]$ Algebra... $= [A - BK(k+1)]^T P(k+1)[A - BK(k+1)]$ $+ \begin{bmatrix} I \\ -K(k+1) \end{bmatrix}^{T} \begin{bmatrix} Q & S \\ S^{T} & R \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} I \\ -K(k+1) \end{bmatrix} \succeq 0$

Summary

- Bellman's dynamic programming invention was a major breakthrough in the theory of multistage decision processes and optimization
- Key ideas
 - Principle of optimality
 Computation of optimal cost function
- Illustrated with a simple multi-stage example

Summary

• Bellman's equation:

 $J_m^o[x(m)] = \min_{u(m)} \left\{ L[x(m), u(m)] + J_{m+1}^o[x(m+1)] \right\}$

- has to be solved backwards in time
- may be difficult to solve
- the solution yields a feedback law

$$J^{o}[x(m)] = \min_{U_{m}} \left\{ L_{f}[x(N)] + \sum_{k=m}^{N-1} L[x(k), u(k)] \right\}$$

Summary

Linear Quadratic Regulator (LQR)

- Bellman's equation is easily solved
- Optimal cost is a quadratic function

$$J^{o}[x(k)] = \frac{1}{2} x^{T}(k) P(k) x(k)$$

- matrix *P* is solved using a Riccati equation
- Optimal control is a linear time varying feedback law

$$u^{o}(k) = -K(k+1)x(k)$$